

immer wieder als ein „moderate realist“ (S. 121). Auch bei der Frage von Gottes Allmacht scheidet er vor Occams Gedanken zurück. Das Interessante ist dabei, daß FitzRalph die damals neuen Gedanken zwar vorsichtig aufnimmt, jedoch nirgends gegen irgendjemanden polemisiert. Hier liegt zugleich der Unterschied zu Bradwardine, der sich von den modernen „Pelagianern“ radikal abwandte und darüber selbst nahezu bei einem vollendeten Determinismus endete.

In den Fragen des freien Willens, der Gnade und der Prädestination bleibt FitzRalph im ganzen ebenfalls beim traditionellen Augustinismus, sucht dabei jedoch vorsichtig, dem freien Willen des Menschen etwas größere Bedeutung zuzuschreiben. Aber stets hält er an der Notwendigkeit fest, daß Gott den freien Willen stärkt (S. 154 f.). Andererseits betont er, daß die Sünder freiwillig sündigen und die Erwählten in der Gnade freiwillig verharren (S. 153).

FitzRalph erscheint so als der Typ des Vermittlungstheologen, der weder auf die Tradition verzichten noch die Fragestellungen seiner Zeit ganz außer Acht lassen will. Was dabei herauskam, war eine im ganzen unselbständige Vermischung disparater Gedanken. Leff, der seinerseits FitzRalph Mangel an „systematic approach“ vorwirft (S. 136), gibt jedoch zu bedenken, daß dieser Sentenzenkommentar vielleicht den Abschluß von FitzRalphs theologischer Ausbildung darstellt (S. 174), so daß man an ihn keine zu hohen Erwartungen stellen darf. Immerhin ist FitzRalphs Kommentar doch insofern wichtig, als er die überragende Bedeutung von Occams Theologie indirekt zugibt und die Verlegenheit zeigt, in der sich die traditionelle Theologie ihr gegenüber befand.

Druckfehler: S. 23 Z. 3 v. u. l. Averroes; S. 48 Z. 4 v. o. l. may; S. 95 Z. 8 v. o. l. state.

Hamburg

Bernhard Lobse

Michael Härtling: Der Meßgesang im Braunschweiger Domstift St. Blasii (Handschrift Niedersächsisches Staatsarchiv in Wolfenbüttel VII B Hs 175). Quellen und Studien zur niedersächsischen Choralgeschichte des 13. und 14. Jahrhunderts. (= Kölner Beiträge zur Musikforschung, Band XXVIII). Regensburg (Bosse) 1963. 237 S., 15 Abb., kart.

One could regret that the title and subtitle to this doctor's thesis for the philosophical faculty of Cologne university were not changed round: The subtitle describes more accurately this absorbing search in the limited but colourful field of the 13th- and 14th-century Mass chant books from the chapter of St Blaise at Brunswick in Lower Saxony. Palaeography, musicology, liturgy and regional church-history are thoroughly integrated here and handled with care.

The introduction lists 64 extant liturgical manuscripts, among which are 23 chant books from the 13th to the 16th century. It surveys the literature and gives the principal data of the chapter's history. The part that opens the actual study consists of three chapters: a) descriptions of 8 noted missals, of a common tones of the Mass, and of a gradual, all at Wolfenbüttel, and of a noted missal at Hannover (23 ff.); b) an investigation into their place and date of origin, and into their history (46 ff.); c) a discussion of the palaeography of the neums – 5 manuscripts with adiastematic, German neums (75 ff.), 6 manuscripts with notation on staves (85 ff.) – concluding with a renewed inquiry into the still problematic development and spreading of the Metz and 'mixed' neums, used for the latter (101 ff.). Two further chapters are dedicated to selected aspects of the Brunswick Gregorian tradition, namely to the introit psalmody (113 ff.) and to the proper of the Easter Mass (126 ff.). The actual study closes with a miscellany of relevant questions: a) criticism of some previous musicological publications on Lower Saxony (152 ff.); b) a collection of possible liturgical background data (164 ff.); c) quotations of 2 juridical texts on the practice of singing (174 f.); d) a survey of records and literature on early German polyphony with a facsimile edition of an unknown organum *Silumen*, henceforth to be regarded as the oldest datable specimen of north German origin: the collegiate church of St Cyriacus, Brunswick, 2nd half 14th century

(176 ff.). The appendix (183 ff.) provides: a) alphabetical and realistic indices to Wolfenbüttel, Staatsarchiv, VII. B. 175, a noted missal with diastematic neums, written for the chapter during the first third of the 14th century; b) a lists of proses found in the chapter manuscripts, followed by one of references to source editions and by a transcription of 4 unpublished proses; c) a selected bibliography of sources and literature.

The wealth of material and, at the same time, the lack of unity in books of this kind and purpose are not only obvious but almost unavoidable. They constitute yet another reason why a reviewer cannot do justice to the many finds made in the very different fields of interest. But it must be deplored when such publications lack indices, especially when bibliography is restricted. Härting used and studied a great number of manuscripts, but the hundreds of details – obits, relics, saints, personalities, place-names, etc. – are lost, unless one studies the book from cover to cover. This does not inspire those who would wish to use the results of his work. For instance, the famous early 14th-century Thomas gradual at Leipzig is frequently cited. Yet, without some hint in a good index, one would scarcely suspect that this thesis contains a fascinating contribution to solving the problem of its origin (114 ff.). The positive evidence fits easily, indeed, into the historical background of Merseburg-Meissen. This clearly indicates that, methodically, we are on the right track. Even the liturgist is almost convinced, but not quite. He has serious objections to the rather easy dismissal of the negative evidence from the litany and the sanctorale (117); he regards the reference to the 'Achener Urexemplar' of the *Gregorianum* as out of place, and that to the title of Ember Saturday in Advent (*Sabbato XII lectionum*), supposedly a confirmation of monastic origin, as a liturgical error.

In the collation of the introit psalmody this Thomas gradual is used as the representative of the German type and, on the authority of P. Wagner, the modern Vatican gradual as representing the Roman type. The question however is which period and which Roman tradition are attested by the Vaticana? The Roman gradual of the 13th and 14th centuries, i. e. that of the papal court, the real contemporary of the Brunswick tradition studied here, gives a very different picture. Most manuscripts and early editions of this gradual contain these common tones. They would have added more historical interest and insight to Härting's tables (119 ff.). In fact, they would have raised many more problems but, oddly enough, also have explained variants for which „kein verursachendes Moment“ was found (125).

The history of the introduction of the musical stave is far from exhausted. Härting, following the general tendency of musicological tradition, restricts himself to the palaeography of the neums; for him, moreover, it entails another, typically German problem. But other, equally important aspects of this issue remain almost entirely ignored. There is, for instance, that of the various pricking and ruling techniques for staves and texts. Here too definite scribal systems were abroad (see my *Origins of the modern Roman liturgy*, London 1960, 216, 330, etc.). They are equally important to musicological palaeography and should be studied just as much as the neums, especially by those concerned with a scriptorium, a school or regional customs. The fact that the Brunswick chapter used so many noted missals (the term *missalia plenaria* is historically incorrect and methodically misleading), i. e. books in which plain texts alternate with noted ones, would have provided an excellent opportunity to study local traditions. Unfortunately, the author has as yet few precedents. Another issue in this connection is the supposed Cistercian origin of the German diastematic notation system. There is no doubt that early Cistercian chant books have diastematic notation with Metz neums; the monks may have propagated these in Germany from the early 13th century. But the earliest datable diastematic manuscripts of non-Cistercian German origin do not go beyond the early 14th century. And these have not Metz neums but a variation which is already recognisable – although difficult to name – in adistematic books of the 13th century. This points to a long-standing tradition, quite independent from the Cistercian history. Something in this current solution is crooked. The present reviewer feels that Härting has been unable to put it straight. In actual fact, from a purely historical point of view

Wagner's suggestion of a "für die regulierten Chorherren in den deutschen Landen üblichen halb Metzzer halb gotischen Neumenformen" (106 f.) is perhaps the best given so far. The restoration of the canonical life during the 12th century favoured a renewed interest in Chrodegang's foundation at Metz, its customs and techniques. The twofold German evolution of both the neums and their diastemy will find more satisfactory answers in the history of the canonical life than in that of the, later and imported, monastic life of the Cistercians.

The author also makes a laudable attempt to remedy the almost complete lack of records on chant in Lower Saxony by collecting whatever church-historical testimonies, ecclesiastical relationships and kalendalia he could find from before 1200 (164 ff.). Historians, obviously, sympathize with such a courageous quest for a ray of light in the seemingly impenetrable darkness. In the circumstances one feels particularly sorry that even the value of the two juridical (not theoretical) texts of the 14th century must be drastically reduced (174 f.). Bishop Siegfried II's instruction for the Moritzstift of Hildesheim is copied from Chrodegang of Metz *Regula canonicorum* (Patrol. lat. 89, 1079, cap. 50), which occurs frequently in late medieval rules of canons (see the previous paragraph); the opening lines of the synodal constitutions by (?) bishop Gerhard are scarcely more than common-places for, at the time, generally accepted practices. Still, it is a truism that liturgical phenomena have a real, historical background and, consequently, cannot be fully understood without it. Unfortunately, they are often due to the *imponderabilia* of religious life; which makes their cause difficult to trace. But the process hardly worked the other way: Not all religious or church-historical events, important or otherwise, have liturgical consequences. Hence one wonders whether this kind of search for 'Liturgische Strömungen' (!) is not something of a desperate, Quixotian battle with shadows.

All this, it is hoped, may show that the significance of Härting's study goes far beyond the boundaries of his subject. The project should be worked out and deserves a better typographical presentation.

London

S. J. P. van Dijk, OFM

Berthe Widmer: Enea Silvio Piccolomini in der sittlichen und politischen Entscheidung (= Basler Beiträge zur Geschichtswissenschaft, 88). Basel (Helbing & Lichtenhahn) 1963. X, 167 S., kart. DM 18.-.

Enea Silvio Piccolomini, der Humanist, der als Dichter freizügiger Liebeslieder und als entschiedener Konziliarist begann und am Ende seines Lebens Papst wurde, hat in der historischen und kirchenhistorischen Literatur bisher keine sonderlich positive Einschätzung erfahren. Die Verfasserin der vorliegenden Arbeit ist überzeugt, daß es sich dabei um ein Fehlurteil handle, und sie sucht ein neues, treffenderes Gesamtbild von der Persönlichkeit und Leistung dieses Mannes zu entwerfen.

Es ist nicht zu leugnen, daß sie starke Argumente auf ihrer Seite hat. Eindrucksvoll ist vor allem der eingehende Nachweis, daß die einzige gründliche und daher bis heute grundlegende Biographie über Piccolomini, das vor über hundert Jahren erschienene dreibändige Werk von Georg Voigt, von einer ganz unpassenden, aus Moralismus und Nationalprotestantismus zusammengesetzten Basis ausgehend, seinem Helden voller Unsachlichkeit und Vorurteil begegnet und bis zu Verdrehungen und Verschleierungen der historischen Tatbestände fortschreitet. Dem von Voigt entworfenen Bild des raffinierten, sitten- und gesinnungslosen Karrieremachers hatte zwar schon Jacob Burckhardt widersprochen, und er hatte Piccolomini, den er gelegentlich als seinen „Liebling“ bezeichnen konnte, vielmehr als den „Normalmenschen der Frührenaissance“ aufgefaßt. Aber eine von diesen Ansätzen ausgehende, umfassende und geschlossene biographische Gesamtanschauung fehlte bisher.

Sie wird nun in dem vorliegenden Buch geboten. Piccolomini erscheint als ein Repräsentant seines Zeitalters – begeistert für die Antike, das Lateinische, die alte Herrlichkeit Italiens, mit wachem Sinn für das Wirkliche, für Historie und Natur,